

2022-2023 End Committee Report Form

Committee: Student Fairness Committee

Chair:
Mahima Agumbe Suresh

Chair-Elect for 2023-2024:

Mahima Agumbe Suresh

Number of Meeting held:
10

Mahima.agumbesuresh@sjsu.edu

(408) 924-2985

Zip: 0180

(Please include phone/zip/email if available)

Items of Business Completed 2022/2023

1. Resolved case numbers: 2122-09, 2223-01, 2223-02, 2223-03
2. Discussed committee's involvement in cases of academic integrity
- 3.

Unfinished Business Items from 2022/2023

1. N/A
- 2.
- 3.

New Business Items for 2023/2024

1. Schedule meetings for AY 23-24
- 2.
- 3.

Please return to the Office of the Academic Senate (CLK 500/0024) by July 1, 2023.

Student Fairness Committee Annual Report

AY 2022-23

Summary

The Student Fairness Committee conducted 10 meetings in AY 2022-23 on the following dates:

- September 14th 2022
- September 28th 2022
- October 12th 2022
- October 26th 2022
- November 9th 2022
- November 30th 2022
- December 7th 2022
- February 8th 2023
- February 22nd 2023
- May 3rd 2023

We resolved the following cases during these meetings:

Case #	Date Filed	Concern	Graduate Semester	Major	Course	College of Faculty Member	Semester of the Course
2122-09	5/17/22	Grade Dispute	Fall 2022 *	Biomedical Engineering	BME 135	College of Engineering	Spring 2022
2223-01	11/4/22 revised (initial on 8/28/22)	Grade Dispute	Summer 2022	Electrical Engineering	EE140	College of Engineering	Summer 2022
2223-02	9/2/22	Grade Dispute	Spring 2025	Engineering Technology in Computer Network System Management	Asian Americans 33B	College of Social Science	Spring 2022

STUDENT FAIRNESS COMMITTEE

2223 -03	5/2/23	Grade Dispute	Spring 2024	Psychology	CCS 30	College of Social Sciences	Summer 2022
-------------	--------	------------------	------------------------	------------	--------	----------------------------------	----------------

Minutes of meetings and meeting agendas

September 14, 2022

Agenda

1. Call to Order and Roll Call
2. Orientation and onboarding to committee:
 - a. Review Committee Charter & S14-3
 - b. Confidentiality
 - c. Attendance (absence protocol)
 - d. Students recruitment status
3. Review of Meeting Minutes from May 18, 2022
4. Election/Nomination for Chair of the SFC for 2022-23 academic year.
5. Review of Agenda:
 - a. Case updates: 2122-02
6. New petition: 2223-02

Case updates and new petitions:

Fall 2021 cases (carryover cases from last semester):

Case #	Date Filed	Concern	Graduate Semester	Major	Course	College of Faculty Member	Semester of the Course
2122-02	8/4/21	Grade Dispute	Fall 2022 (changed to Summer 2022)	MBA	BUS 270 Financial Management	College of Business	Spring 2021

STUDENT FAIRNESS COMMITTEE

New case:

Case #	Date Filed	Concern	Graduate Semester	Major	Course	College of Faculty Member	Semester of the Course
2223-02	9/2/22	Grade Dispute	Spring 2025	Engineering Technology in Computer Network System management	Asian Americans 33B	College of Engineering	Spring 2022

** Student is graduating this semester, the case needs to be prioritized.*

Next Committee Meeting: September 28, 2022 via zoom.

Minutes of the meeting

Members Present: F. Lau, M. Agumbe Suresh, N. Dubus, F. Ditroia, K. Tsai, R. Chopra, G. Vinuales

Also Present: K. Hambrook

Absent: N/A

Recorder: Feyon Lau

The meeting was called to order at 3:05 pm.

I. Updates:

i) Action chair confirmed the receipt of confidentiality forms signed by the 4 new faculty members.

ii) Election for SFC Chair for 2022-23 academic year. One returning member was nominated. Motion to vote,

Yes: 6

No: 0

Abstain: 0

unanimously accepted to elect the new chair.

iii) No student members as of today and no case investigation can be conducted without students. Student recruitment issue will be brought to the Academic Senate's attention.

II. Review:

Minutes from May 18, 2022 unanimously approved with modification by the acting chair.

Cases:

2122-02: The instructor appealed and the case was forwarded to the Board of Academic Freedom and Professional Responsibility (BAFPR) to review.

III. New Cases:

2223-01: On hold. The student provided new information after petitioning the grade dispute. Based on the new information, the Student Ombudsperson assisted the

STUDENT FAIRNESS COMMITTEE

student going back to the inform resolution stage to see if it could resolve at the college level.

2223-02: The student had a technical issue on the day of the final exam but the professor treated it as requesting a make-up exam. There is an inconsistency of the outcome that the student mentioned in the petition and the supporting documents. The Student Ombudsperson will contact the student to clarify it. The committee discussed and voted to accept the case.

Yes: 6

No: 0

Abstain: 0

A faculty member was assigned to the subcommittee but no student availability for the assignment. The case will be started to investigate once a student member is assigned.

IV. Other discussions:

None.

V. Adjourned at 4:15pm

September 28, 2022

Agenda

1. Call to Order and Roll Call
2. Review of Meeting Minutes from Sep 14, 2022
3. Brief orientation and onboarding to new committee members if any:
 - a. Review Committee Charter & S14-3
 - b. Confidentiality
4. Students Recruitment Status
5. Review and Discuss Cases: 2122-02, 2122-08, 2122-09, 2223-02
6. New Petition: n/a

Case updates and new petitions:

Fall 2021 cases (carryover cases from 2 semesters ago):

Case #	Date Filed	Concern	Graduate Semester	Major	Course	College of Faculty Member	Semester of the Course
2122-02	8/4/21	Grade Dispute	Fall 2022 * (changed to Summer 2022)	MBA	BUS 270 Financial Management	College of Business	Spring 2021

Spring 2022 cases (carryover cases from last semester):

STUDENT FAIRNESS COMMITTEE

Case #	Date Filed	Concern	Graduate Semester	Major	Course	College of Faculty Member	Semester of the Course
2122-08	5/13/22	Grade Dispute	Fall 2022 *	English and Comparative Literature	Engl. 225	College of Humanities and the Arts	Spring 2022
2122-09	5/17/22	Grade Dispute	Fall 2022 *	Fall 2022	BME 135	College of Engineering	Spring 2022

New case:

Case #	Date Filed	Concern	Graduate Semester	Major	Course	College of Faculty Member	Semester of the Course
2223-02	9/2/22	Grade Dispute	Spring 2025	Engineering Technology in Computer Network System management	Asian Americans 33B	College of Engineering	Spring 2022

* Student is graduating this semester, the case needs to be prioritized.

Next Committee Meeting: October 12, 2022 via zoom.

STUDENT FAIRNESS COMMITTEE

Minutes of the meeting

Members Present: F. Lau, M. Agumbe Suresh, N. Dubus, F. Ditroia, K. Tsai, R. Chopra, G. Vinuales, K. Hambrook

Also Present:

Absent: N/A

Recorder: Gema Vinuales

The meeting was called to order at 3:04 pm._

I. Review:

Minutes from September 14, 2022 unanimously approved.

II. Updates:

A student was approved to join the committee yesterday. Not present.

The Student Ombudsperson reached out to the Senate requesting help to recruit students.

Cases:

2122-02: No updates. The BAFPR committee is currently understaffed and doesn't have a quorum. Will review the decision. Case flagged as special circumstances - grade can be changed even if the student graduated already.

2122-08: This is a case of academic dishonesty. Case should be handled by SCED. The Ombudsperson will discuss with the Chair of the Academic Senate as BAFPR doesn't have a quorum. We will review feedback at the next meeting.

2122-09: Committee will take the case (Yes: 5, No: 1, Abstain: 1). Case assigned to a faculty member. The case will be started to investigate once a student member is assigned.

2223-01: On hold. The student provided new information after petitioning the grade dispute. Based on the new information, the Student Ombudsperson assisted the student going back to the informal resolution stage to see if it could resolve at the college level.

2223-02: No updates. No student assigned to the case yet.

III. New Cases:

IV. Other discussions:

None.

V. Adjourned at 4:20 pm

Next meeting - Oct 12, 2022

October 12, 2022

Agenda

1. Call to Order and Roll Call
2. Brief orientation and onboarding to new committee members if any:
 - a. Review Committee Charter & [S14-3](#)
 - b. Confidentiality
3. Review of Meeting Minutes from Sep 28, 2022
4. Students Recruitment Status
5. Review and Discuss Cases: 2122-02, 2122-08, 2122-09, 2223-02
6. New Petition: n/a

Case updates and new petitions:

Fall 2021 cases (carryover cases from 2 semesters ago):

Case #	Date Filed	Concern	Graduate Semester	Major	Course	College of Faculty Member	Semester of the Course
2122-02	8/4/21	Grade Dispute	Fall 2022 * (changed to Summer 2022)	MBA	BUS 270 Financial Management	College of Business	Spring 2021

Spring 2022 cases (carryover cases from last semester):

STUDENT FAIRNESS COMMITTEE

Case #	Date Filed	Concern	Graduate Semester	Major	Course	College of Faculty Member	Semester of the Course
2122-08	5/13/22	Grade Dispute	Fall 2022 *	English and Comparative Literature	Engl. 225	College of Humanities and the Arts	Spring 2022
2122-09	5/17/22	Grade Dispute	Fall 2022 *	Fall 2022	BME 135	College of Engineering	Spring 2022

New case:

Case #	Date Filed	Concern	Graduate Semester	Major	Course	College of Faculty Member	Semester of the Course
2223-02	9/2/22	Grade Dispute	Spring 2025	Engineering Technology in Computer Network System management	Asian Americans 33B	College of Engineering	Spring 2022

* Student is graduating this semester, the case needs to be prioritized.

Next Committee Meeting: October 26, 2022 via zoom.

Minutes of the meeting

Present: Mahima Suresh, Nicole Dubus, Feyon Lau, Kyle Hambrook, Fabio Di Troia, Kim Tsai, Ruma Chopra, Fancesca Teixeira, Gema Vinuales

Note taker: Nicole Dubus

The meeting was called to order at 3:05 pm.

I. Review

Review of 9/28/22 minutes. Minutes approved unanimously with change: students reports will be anonymous.

II. Updates

1. Student recruitment: No students in committee as of this meeting. We need to wait to review cases until we get student member.

III. Cases

1. Ombudsperson presented on 2122-08 Student was charged with plagiarizing. Student filed complaint. Question from our committee: is this a case for us or for student affairs. Student conduct and ethic , board of academic freedom . Academic integrity should go to bafpr. Chair of academic senate advised to contact student affairs. (Chair and Ombuds will follow up with this contact).
0. We need clarification on the process among these three committees: SFC committee, BAFPR, SCED. Which cases should go where? How are cases/complaints submitted? Is there a hierarchy about which committee gets cases first, etc.

IV. Other discussions

1. SCED associate director (AD) joins meeting at 3:30pm. Short introductions. Case student in english class who received an F for plagiarism. The case was referred to SCED. Findings were inconclusive.
 - a. SCED AD: when a student has any integrity concern meets with faculty, then to SCED . SCED reviews all second and more complaints with same student. Teacher failed student due to first event (draft of term paper proposal and citation). Second offense got attention of SCED. Student was told process of meeting with associate dean, dean, ... "If you would like to follow-up further about this report, please contact your instructor and arrange a meeting. The goal of this meeting would be to seek resolution. If an acceptable resolution is not reached, then you should contact the Department Chair. If a resolution is not reached after consultation with the department chair, then you should contact the Associate Dean. If you'd like additional assistance, the University Ombudsperson may be of assistance by completing their intake form."

STUDENT FAIRNESS COMMITTEE

a. SCED can talk to faculty if the consequence is too harsh or the event is not a problem.

a. SCED AD discusses graduate classes often putting in syllabus that one plagiarizing occurrence is enough to receive an F in the course. This is not common in undergraduates. Unclear of process for BAFPR.

a. Question from the committee: what is our role in cheating and plagiarizing?
SCED AD: were the expectations and grading fair, not about academic integrity specifically. What does the BAFPR do? They receive integrity appeals (if sced can't resolve it). SFC looks at patterns of unfairness, but not academic integrity.

a. Link to F15-7, University Policy on Academic Integrity
<https://www.sjsu.edu/senate/docs/F15-7.pdf>

SFC is a resource for the student. But we are not in the SCED pipeline.

Note: Section one of F15-7; Under academic sanctions 3.1; Academic Sanctions 3.1.7 SCED can review if faculty asks for event #1; SCED is the only sanctioning body. On second event and onward SCED gets involved regardless of faculty request.

SCED AD discussed case on academic integrity in two classes in two different semesters. Was it fair that the teacher went back to previous class and found plagiarism. Discussions are happening with faculty, student could ask SFC to review.

4:31pm SCED AD leaves meeting

Post speaker discussion: Talk to head of student affairs about case. BAFPR is understaffed and not able to be quick in accepting this case. We are turning down the case as it is outside our scope.

Please reach out to your college for student recruitment. We have two cases waiting for student in committee. One case, the student is graduating this semester. We wonder if students can get an incentive to join.

V. Adjourn 4:40pm.

October 26, 2022

Agenda

1. Call to Order and Roll Call
2. Brief orientation and onboarding to new committee members if any:
 - a. Review Committee Charter & S14-3
 - b. Confidentiality
3. Review of Meeting Minutes from Oct 12, 2022
4. Students Recruitment Status
5. Review and Discuss Cases: 2122-02, 2122-08, 2122-09, 2223-02
6. New Petition: no

Case updates and new petitions:

Fall 2021 cases (carryover cases from 2 semesters ago):

Case #	Date Filed	Concern	Graduate Semester	Major	Course	College of Faculty Member	Semester of the Course
2122-02	8/4/21	Grade Dispute	Fall 2022 * (changed to Summer 2022)	MBA	BUS 270 Financial Management	College of Business	Spring 2021

Spring 2022 cases (carryover cases from last semester):

STUDENT FAIRNESS COMMITTEE

Case #	Date Filed	Concern	Graduate Semester	Major	Course	College of Faculty Member	Semester of the Course
2122-08	5/13/22	Grade Dispute	Fall 2022 *	English and Comparative Literature	Engl. 225	College of Humanities and the Arts	Spring 2022
2122-09	5/17/22	Grade Dispute	Fall 2022 *	Fall 2022	BME 135	College of Engineering	Spring 2022

New cases 2022-23:

Case #	Date Filed	Concern	Graduate Semester	Major	Course	College of Faculty Member	Semester of the Course
2223-02	9/2/22	Grade Dispute	Spring 2025	Engineering Technology in Computer Network System management	Asian Americans 33B	College of Social Science	Spring 2022

* Student is graduating this semester, the case needs to be prioritized.

Next Committee Meeting: November 9, 2022 via zoom.

Minutes of the meeting

Members Present: Feyon Lau, Mahima Agumbe Suresh, Nicole Dubus, Fabio Di Troia, Robert Davis, Carolyn Guel, Kyle Hambrook, Ruma Chopra, Gema Vinuales, Kim Tsai, Raj Somaiya

Also Present:

Absent: Francesa Teixeira, Harshitha Ramesh

Recorder: Kim Tsai

The meeting was called to order at 3:08 pm_

I. Updates:

i) Welcome Carolyn Guel to the committee!

ii) Two new student members have been recruited to the committee and signed the confidentiality agreement. One student joined the meeting at 3:35pm, but the other student was not present. Both student members can be assigned to the new cases.

iii) One student member from last year is interested in re-joining, but they need approval to join the committee because they are registered for 1 credit.

II. Review:

Minutes from October 12, 2022 unanimously approved with modification by the chair to keep names anonymous in meeting minutes and minor correction of minor typos.

Cases:

2122-02: Waiting for BAFPR to address the case.

2122-08: Academic Affairs agrees that SCED should handle this case and bring this case to BAFPR

- SFC Chair sent a petition rejection letter to the student.
- Case is closed and SFC will not move forward with this case.

III. New Cases:

2122-09: The petition was submitted before the last day of fall 2022 semester but after the last SFC meeting day.

- SFC Chair will assign a student member to this case.

STUDENT FAIRNESS COMMITTEE

- This case was reassigned to a different SFC faculty member in order to expedite the review process.
- Student is graduating this semester, therefore the case must be resolved by the end of this semester

2223-02: The student had a technical issue on the day of the final exam but the professor treated it as requesting a make-up exam.

- This case was assigned to a student member who will work with a SFC faculty member to investigate the case.

IV. Other discussions:

None.

V. Adjourned at 3:45

November 9, 2022

Agenda

1. Call to Order and Roll Call
2. Brief orientation and onboarding to new committee members if any:
 - a. Review Committee Charter & S14-3
 - b. Confidentiality
3. Review of Meeting Minutes from Oct 26, 2022
4. Students Recruitment Status
5. Review and Discuss Cases: 2223-02, 2122-02, 2122-09,
6. New Petition: 2223-01

Case updates and new petitions:

Fall 2021 cases (carryover cases from 2 semesters ago):

Case #	Date Filed	Concern	Graduate Semester	Major	Course	College of Faculty Member	Semester of the Course
2122-02	8/4/21	Grade Dispute	Fall 2022 * (changed to Summer 2022)	MBA	BUS 270 Financial Management	College of Business	Spring 2021

Spring 2022 cases (carryover cases from last semester):

STUDENT FAIRNESS COMMITTEE

Case #	Date Filed	Concern	Graduate Semester	Major	Course	College of Faculty Member	Semester of the Course
2122-09	5/17/22	Grade Dispute	Fall 2022 *	Biomedical Engineering	BME 135	College of Engineering	Spring 2022

Cases of 2022-23:

Case #	Date Filed	Concern	Graduate Semester	Major	Course	College of Faculty Member	Semester of the Course
2223-01	11/4/22 revised (initial on 8/28/22)	Grade Dispute	Summer 2022	Electrical Engineering	EE140	College of Engineering	Summer 2022
2223-02	9/2/22	Grade Dispute	Spring 2025	Engineering Technology in Computer Network System Management	Asian Americans 33B	College of Social Science	Spring 2022

* Student is graduating this semester, the case needs to be prioritized.

Next Committee Meeting: November 23, 2022 via zoom.

Minutes of the meeting

Members Present: F. Lau, M. Agumbe Suresh, N. Dubus, F. Di Troia, K. Tsai, R. Chopra, G. Vinuales, C. Guel, R. Davis, R. Somaiya, H. Ramesh

Also Present: N/A

Absent: F. Teixeira, K, Hambrook

Recorder: F. Di Troia

The meeting was called to order at 3:05 pm..

I. Updates:

None.

II. Review:

Minutes from October 26th unanimously approved.

Cases:

EDIT BELOW

2123-02: The instructor and the student have been interviewed via email by the sub-committee.

The student confirmed that the professor did not allow him to retake the exam. The student's explanation on why he thought to deserve a better grade was not considered satisfactory by the sub-committee. He also claimed technical issues in his communication with the professor, even though, as referred by the ombudsperson, the student admitted a mistake from his side.

The instructor confirmed that he sent a message to the class (posted on Canvas on March 7th, way before the date of the final exam under dispute) informing the students about the class policy (i.e., no make-up exams except for jury duty and disability). He also sent another message to the class to remind the students that the messages on Canvas and the syllabus were a *de facto* contract. The professor also informed the sub-committee that he made several accommodations in favor of the student throughout the semester and, for the final exam, he simply applied his policy.

No unfairness has been found in the instructor's behavior, however, the instructor seems to have broken his own policy by allowing a make-up quiz for another student.

STUDENT FAIRNESS COMMITTEE

The committee will collect evidence of how much time the student was able to see the quiz after clicking the wrong link, and will collect more evidence on why the professor gave the opportunity to complete a make-up quiz for another student.

2122-02: No updates at the moment of the meeting. The case will be discussed during the next meeting.

2122-09: The student has been interviewed via email by the sub-committee. She confirmed the information already known by the committee. She thinks that the instructor, by answering during lectures to the possible questions that could appear in the exam (a certification exam on which the professor has no control), gives an unfair advantage to the students that, by luck, receive the same questions during such an exam.

The instructor has not been interviewed yet.

The sub-committee will collect the instructor's viewpoint, in particular how the grading of the questions is performed.

2223-01: The case is introduced to the committee. The student missed several assignments and the second midterm due to military duty for his own country (Taiwan).

Policy S22-2 has been reviewed, and excuses due to military duty are indeed considered, however, it is not clear if the policy applies to non-U.S. military duty.

The student will be able to pass the class if the missing assignments are satisfactory enough, however, the professor claimed otherwise.

There were no objections on taking the case, and a sub-committee has been formed to investigate the case.

III. New Cases:

None.

IV. Other discussions:

A poll on when to hold the next committee meeting has been sent by the chair to the members (November 23rd, or November 30th).

V. Adjourned at 4:40pm

November 30, 2022

Agenda

1. Call to Order and Roll Call
2. Review of Meeting Minutes from Nov 9, 2022
3. Review and Discuss Cases: 2122-02, 2122-09, 2223-01,2223-02
4. New Petition: no

Case updates and new petitions:

Fall 2021 cases (carryover cases from 2 semesters ago):

Case #	Date Filed	Concern	Graduate Semester	Major	Course	College of Faculty Member	Semester of the Course
2122-02	8/4/21	Grade Dispute	Fall 2022 * (changed to Summer 2022)	MBA	BUS 270 Financial Management	College of Business	Spring 2021

Spring 2022 cases (carryover cases from last semester):

Case #	Date Filed	Concern	Graduate Semester	Major	Course	College of Faculty Member	Semester of the Course
2122-09	5/17/22	Grade Dispute	Fall 2022 *	Biomedical Engineering	BME 135	College of Engineering	Spring 2022

STUDENT FAIRNESS COMMITTEE

Cases of 2022-23:

Case #	Date Filed	Concern	Graduate Semester	Major	Course	College of Faculty Member	Semester of the Course
2223-01	11/4/22 revised (initial on 8/28/22)	Grade Dispute	Summer 2022	Electrical Engineering	EE140	College of Engineering	Summer 2022
2223-02	9/2/22	Grade Dispute	Spring 2025	Engineering Technology in Computer Network System Management	Asian Americans 33B	College of Social Science	Spring 2022

* *Student is graduating this semester, the case needs to be prioritized.*

Next Committee Meeting: December 7, 2022 (last meeting in Fall 2022) via zoom.

STUDENT FAIRNESS COMMITTEE

Minutes of the Meeting

Members Present: F. Lau, M. Agumbe Suresh, N. Dubus, G. Vinuales, F. Di Troia, K. Hambrook, C. Guel, F. Teixeira, E. Shih, K. Hambrook, R. Chopra.

Also Present:

Absent: H. Ramesh, R. Somaiya

Recorder: Kyle Hambrook

Called to order at 3:05 pm

I. Updates:

None

II. Review:

Minutes from Nov 9, 2022 unanimously approved.

Cases:

2122-02: Board of Academic Freedom and Professional Responsibility (BAFPR) to review will hear the case.

2122-09: Subcommittee updated committee on status of investigation. Committee expects to review and vote on subcommittee report at next meeting.

2223-01: Subcommittee has contacted student. Waiting for student response.

2223-02: Subcommittee contacted instructor to verify student's central claim. Committee discussed appropriate recommendations for the subcommittee report.

III. New Cases:

IV. Other discussions:

None.

V. Adjourned at 4:24pm

December 7, 2022

Agenda

1. Call to Order and Roll Call
2. Review of Meeting Minutes from Nov 30, 2022
3. Review and Discuss Cases: 2122-02, 2122-09, 2223-01,2223-02
4. New Petition: no

Case updates and new petitions:

Fall 2021 cases (carryover cases from 2 semesters ago):

Case #	Date Filed	Concern	Graduate Semester	Major	Course	College of Faculty Member	Semester of the Course
2122-02	8/4/21	Grade Dispute	Fall 2022 * (changed to Summer 2022)	MBA	BUS 270 Financial Management	College of Business	Spring 2021

Spring 2022 cases (carryover cases from last semester):

Case #	Date Filed	Concern	Graduate Semester	Major	Course	College of Faculty Member	Semester of the Course
2122-09	5/17/22	Grade Dispute	Fall 2022 *	Biomedical Engineering	BME 135	College of Engineering	Spring 2022

STUDENT FAIRNESS COMMITTEE

Cases of 2022-23:

Case #	Date Filed	Concern	Graduate Semester	Major	Course	College of Faculty Member	Semester of the Course
2223-01	11/4/22 revised (initial on 8/28/22)	Grade Dispute	Summer 2022	Electrical Engineering	EE140	College of Engineering	Summer 2022
2223-02	9/2/22	Grade Dispute	Spring 2025	Engineering Technology in Computer Network System Management	Asian Americans 33B	College of Social Science	Spring 2022

* Student is graduating this semester, the case needs to be prioritized.

Next Committee Meeting: February 8, 2023 (First meeting in Spring 2023) via zoom.

STUDENT FAIRNESS COMMITTEE

Minutes of the Meeting

Members Present: F. Lau, M. Agumbe Suresh, N. Dubus, G. Vinuales, F. Di Troia, F. Teixeira, E. Shih, K. Hambrook.

Also Present:

Absent: C. Guel, R. Chopra, H. Ramesh

Recorder: Emmy Shih

The meeting was called to order at 3:05 pm._

I. Updates:

II. Review:

Minutes from November 30, 2022 unanimously approved.

Cases:

2122-02: The instructor appealed and the case will be discussed by the Board of Academic Freedom and Professional Responsibility (BAFPR) on Friday 12/09.

2122-09: Subcommittee report on their findings. Committee reviewed subcommittee report and found in favor of the instructor. Chair will submit the report and share it with the relevant parties.

Yes: 8

No: 0

Abstain: 0

2223-01: Both instructor and student agreed to change the student's grade to an Incomplete. The subcommittee will write a report to conclude the case on the mutual decision.

Suggestion: Email the professor to share their action plan to resolve the incomplete with the students. Subcommittee will include the professor and student's contract into the report to vote on for next meeting.

2223-02: The Subcommittee presented the report on their findings. Committee reviewed the subcommittee findings and found in favor of the student. Subcommittee will submit the report and share the recommendations to the relevant parties.

Yes: 8

No: 0

Abstain: 0

III. New Cases:

None

IV. Other discussions:

None.

V. Adjourned at 4:00 pm

February 8, 2023

Agenda

1. Call to Order and Roll Call
2. Orientation and onboarding new members to committee:
 - a. Brief Review Committee Charter & S14-3 if needed
 - b. Confidentiality
 - c. Attendance (absence protocol)
3. Review of Meeting Minutes from Dec 7, 2022
4. Review and Discuss Cases: 2122-02, 2122-09, 2223-01,2223-02
5. New Petition: No

Case updates and new petitions:

Fall 2021 cases (carryover cases from 2 semesters ago):

Case #	Date Filed	Concern	Graduate Semester	Major	Course	College of Faculty Member	Semester of the Course
2122-02	8/4/21	Grade Dispute	Fall 2022 * (changed to Summer 2022)	MBA	BUS 270 Financial Management	College of Business	Spring 2021

STUDENT FAIRNESS COMMITTEE

Spring 2022 cases (carryover cases from last semester):

Case #	Date Filed	Concern	Graduate Semester	Major	Course	College of Faculty Member	Semester of the Course
2122-09	5/17/22	Grade Dispute	Fall 2022 *	Biomedical Engineering	BME 135	College of Engineering	Spring 2022

Cases of 2022-23:

Case #	Date Filed	Concern	Graduate Semester	Major	Course	College of Faculty Member	Semester of the Course
2223-01	11/4/22 revised (initial on 8/28/22)	Grade Dispute	Summer 2022	Electrical Engineering	EE140	College of Engineering	Summer 2022
2223-02	9/2/22	Grade Dispute	Spring 2025	Engineering Technology in Computer Network System Management	Asian Americans 33B	College of Social Science	Spring 2022

* Student is graduating this semester, the case needs to be prioritized.

Next Committee Meeting: February 22, 2023 via zoom.

Minutes of the Meeting

Members Present: F. Lau, K. Hambrook, M. Agumbe Suresh, F. Di Troia, G. Vinuales, N. Dubus, R. Davis, C. Guel, S. Das, F. Teixeira, R. Somaiya, E. Shih, S. Bashash, S. Yella

Absent: K. Tsai, R. Chopra, H. Ramesh

Recorder: Saeid Bashash

The meeting was called to order at 3:05 pm._

I. Updates:

i) Two new student members were introduced.

II. Review:

Minutes from Dec. 7, 2022 were unanimously approved.

Cases:

2122-02: The instructor appealed SFC's decision. The Associate dean for graduate studies was informed. The Board of Academic Freedom and Professional Responsibility (BAFPR) supported SFC's recommendation. Case closed for SFC. Waiting for the grade change to be submitted. Student ombudsman will communicate with the student related to the change of grade when it is completed.

2122-09: SFC voted in favor of the instructor, and communicated the decision with the related parties. Case closed.

2223-01: Subcommittee drafted the report. The student and the instructor agreed to the grade of Incomplete. The student will need to complete the course within 1 year. Subcommittee will ask the instructor to provide a contract letter detailing the plan for the student to complete the course.

2223-02: Instructor accepted the SFC's recommendation to give the student another final exam. After a few miscommunications between the student and the instructor, the student was able to finally take the exam on Feb. 6. SFC is currently waiting to receive an update on the exam results.

III. New Cases:

None.

IV. Other discussions:

None.

V. Adjourned at 3:40pm

February 22, 2023

Agenda

1. Call to Order and Roll Call
2. Orientation and onboarding new members to committee if any:
 - a. Brief Review Committee Charter & S14-3 if needed
 - b. Confidentiality
 - c. Attendance (absence protocol)
3. Review of Meeting Minutes from Feb 8, 2023
4. Review and Discuss Cases: 2223-01, 2223-02
5. New Petition: No

Case updates and new petitions:

Cases of 2022-23:

Case #	Date Filed	Concern	Graduate Semester	Major	Course	College of Faculty Member	Semester of the Course
2223-01	11/4/22 revised (initial on 8/28/22)	Grade Dispute	Summer 2022	Electrical Engineering	EE140	College of Engineering	Summer 2022
2223-02	9/2/22	Grade Dispute	Spring 2025	Engineering Technology in Computer Network System Management	Asian Americans 33B	College of Social Science	Spring 2022



STUDENT FAIRNESS COMMITTEE

** Student is graduating this semester, the case needs to be prioritized.*

Next Committee Meeting: March 8, 2023 via zoom

Minutes of the Meeting

Members Present: F. Lau, K. Hambrook, M. Agumbe Suresh, F. Di Troia, G. Vinuales, N. Dubus, C. Guel, E. Shih, S. Bashash, K. Tsai, R. Chopra

Also Present:

Absent: S. Das, F. Teixeira, R. Somaiya, S. Yella, H. Ramesh

Recorder: C Guel

The meeting was called to order at 3:05 pm.

I. Updates:

II. Review:

Minutes from Feb 8, 2023 unanimously approved with no modifications

Cases:

2223-02:

Case Closed: Grade change to B+

2223-01: The student provided new information after petitioning the grade dispute. Based on the new information, the Student Ombudsperson assisted the student going back to the inform resolution stage to see if it could resolve at the college level.

Subcommittee report was accepted after necessary changes. Vote statistic:

Yes: 8

No: 0

Abstain:0

8 eligible voting members

III. New Cases:

No new cases

IV. Other discussions:

None.

V. Adjourned at 3:22pm

SJSU SAN JOSÉ STATE
UNIVERSITY

STUDENT FAIRNESS COMMITTEE

May 3, 2023

Agenda

1. Call to Order and Roll Call
2. Review of Meeting Minutes from Feb 22, 2023
3. Nomination for Chair of the SFC for next term starting in Fall 2023 (2023-24 academic year)
4. Election for the Chair of the SFC for next term.
5. Review and Discuss Cases: 2223-01
6. New Petition: 2223-03

Case updates and new petitions:

Cases of 2022-23:

Case #	Date Filed	Concern	Graduate Semester	Major	Course	College of Faculty Member	Semester of the Course
2223-01	11/4/22 revised (initial on 8/28/22)	Grade Dispute	Summer 2022	Electrical Engineering	EE140	College of Engineering	Summer 2022
2223-03	5/2/23	Grade Dispute	Spring 2024	Psychology	CCS 30	College of Social Sciences	Summer 2022

* Student is graduating this semester, the case needs to be prioritized.

Next Committee Meeting: March 17, 2023 via zoom. (The last Spring 2023 meeting)

STUDENT FAIRNESS COMMITTEE

Minutes of the meeting

Members Present: F. Lau, K. Hambrook, M. Agumbe Suresh, F. Di Troia, G. Vinuales, N. Dubus, S. Bashash, K. Tsai, F. Teixeira

Also Present: N/A

Absent: C. Guel, E. Shih, S. Das, R. Somaiya, S. Yella, H. Ramesh

Recorder: F. Teixeira

The meeting was called to order at 3:05 pm.

I. Updates:

- i) Motion to accept minutes accepted by SFC members Hambrook and seconded by Dubus.
- ii) Election for SFC Chair for 2023-24 academic year. 1 was nominated. Motion to vote, nominee current SFC Chairperson Suresh.

Yes: 7

No: 0

Abstain: 0

SFC present members unanimously accepted to elect the new chair.

II. Review:

Cases:

2223-01: SFC recommendation sent to the student, professor and chair. Professor changed the grade to an 'INC' as of 3/23/2023.

III. New Cases:

2223-03: Discussed potential new case. The final exam date on Canvas (7/3/22) was different from the syllabus (7/1/22). The student logged in trying to take the exam on 7/3/22 but realized that the exam was past. The student reached out to the professor but the professor misinterpreted her email as a threat and stopped responding to her. Committee discussed options to take on the case, referred to SFC bylaws of Grade Disputes: Part I. Motion to proceed with case:

Yes: 5

No: 0

Abstain: 0

STUDENT FAIRNESS COMMITTEE

Chair will check with the Academic Senate to determine if SFC can take on the case.
Tentative subcommittee will consist of SFC member Tsai and a student.

IV. Other discussions:

None.

V. Adjourned at 3:41pm

Recommended Policy Changes

1) Include "pending SFC cases" as one of the definitions of the "extraordinary circumstances" in [S09-7](#) policy.

Rationale:

- i. Recent graduate students have been told to delay their graduation term when having a pending SFC case as the policy stated "[a]fter a degree has been posted, no further adjustments can be made on the record except under extraordinary circumstances as determined by Graduate or Undergraduate Studies."
- ii. It puts a disadvantage and negative impact on students as they are pushed to make an unfair decision: either delaying their graduation to the next semester or so, or dropping their SFC grade dispute case and holding the questionable grade on their transcript/degree forever because they need to graduate asap.
- iii. When there is a case that a professor is delaying to respond or appeal the case to the BAFPR which could prolong the grade dispute process to more than a semester. Not only the student couldn't afford to wait for another semester, but the professor can use it as a trick to avoid the case proceeding as the case could pretty much need to be dropped in a way that there is no point to proceeding if no grade change can be resulted.

Resolution: The student can still graduate on time with their degree awarded but then when the SFC grade dispute is settled with warranting a grade change later (even after the student graduated with their degree), their new grade could still be changed and reflected in our system and they could order an official transcript to reflect the new grade.

2) Remove or modify the grievance process in the [S14-3](#) policy - redirect the grievance process to be handled by Faculty Affairs/UP, and/or Academic Affairs (deans).

Rationale:

- i. After some discussions with multiple parties including previous academic senate chair (Ravisha Mathur), SFC chair (Edward Cohen), Senior Director of Employee Relations, Retention & Equal Opportunity (Julie Paisant), and Senior Associate Vice President of University Personnel (Joanne Wright), all believed that grievance process is inappropriate to be handled by the SFC for: 1) no actionable/disciplinary action could be warranted; 2) faculty personnel issue should be handle by UP and/or higher administrator (Dean of the College).

STUDENT FAIRNESS COMMITTEE

ii. Faculty confidentiality concern - With the current process, it could fritter away the efforts and time of the SFC on the investigation process for not much a concrete outcome but letting some other faculty members and committee members to discuss performance issues of a faculty member if the involved case is a complaint against a faculty member. It doesn't sound fair to the faculty member, who should have the ability to have performance issues handled confidentially.

iii. The 3-step early resolution process can still be remained as an informal process stated in the [S14-3](#) policy. However, the formal process should be handled by Faculty Affairs/UP, not SFC.

iv. There might be more to discuss for the academic senate of how the grievance process should be handled in a bigger picture.

Resolution: To eliminate any unnecessary process, and to promote equitable and effective proceeding, removing the formal process handled by the SFC and replacing it with Faculty Affairs/UP or Academic Affairs/College dean after the 3 informal resolution steps are recommended.

3) S14-3 does not clearly state that grade appeals need to be made only after final grades are posted.